

#### BEFORE THE ELECTRICITY OMBUDSMAN, HARYANA

## Haryana Electricity Regulatory Commission Bays No. 33 - 36, Sector – 4, Panchkula-134109 Telephone No. 0172-2572299; Website: - herc.nic.in

E-mail: eo.herc@nic.in

(Regd. Post)

 Appeal No.
 : 31/2024

 Registered on
 : 10.09.2024

 Date of Order
 : 25.11.2024

#### In the matter of:

Appeal against the order dated 13.08.2024 passed by CGRF UHBVN Panchkula in complaint no. 226/2024.

Smt. Neeru Chopra W/o Shri Vinod Chopra, House No. 35-36, Shanti Nagar, Model Town, Panipat

Appellant

#### Versus

- 1. The Executive Engineer / Operation, City Division, UHBVN, Panipat
- 2. The SDO/ Operation, Model Town Sub-Division, UHBVN, Panipat

Respondent

#### Before:

Shri Virendra Singh, Electricity Ombudsman

## Present on behalf of Appellant:

Smt. Neeru Chopra and Shri Vinod Chopra

### Present on behalf of Respondents:

Shri Raj Kumar, CA O/o SDO/ Operation, Model Town S/Div., UHBVN, Panipat Shri Ram Mehar, LDC O/o SDO/ Operation, Model Town S/Div., UHBVN, Panipat

#### **ORDER**

**A.** Smt. Neeru Chopra has filed an appeal against the order dated 13.08.2024 passed by CGRF, UHBVNL, Panchkula in complaint No. 226/2024. The appellant has requested the following relief: -

I am writing to make a formal appeal against the order issued by the consumer Grievances Redressal Forum in respect to my complaint submitted under complaint no.226/2024. I am not satisfied with the justification provided by the forum against my appeal and found it irrelevant to my original complaint what I had submitted.

Let me provide a little background on my issue – Chronology of events

S.	Event	Event Description	Document
No	Date/Time	reference	
1	_	Installation of old M. No.2231203UDN031345	
2	15th Feb 2021 – 17th May 2023	Average bills raised by Meter reader continuously from 15.02.2021 – 17.05.2023.	
3	17th May 2023	Old meter was removed, and same day new meter was installed.	June 2023 Bill enclosed
4	17th May 2023	No process was being followed by the electricity team who removed or installed the meter. No acknowledgement was taken from us while removing or installing meter neither any meter (new or old) being shown to us.	
5	June 2023	Bill generated in month of June 2023 where 1359.32 units consumed under my new meter - LT2015390.	

6	June 2023 – Jan 2024	However, under Old meter no 2231203UDN03134524739 first time OK reading was taken and 24739 units were recorded. Under Consumed units 111.38 units were only billed. Total units consumed in that month were 1470.7  From June 2023 – Jan 2024 no mentioned in the bill about the 24739 units.	
7	Feb 2024	105358 /- Rs. Sundry Charges were imposed in the Bill while consumed units was 1367.96. Last photo of old meter reading clearly show 2473 units only however board is claiming there is 9 in the end which make the units from 2473 to 24739	Old meter Pic enclosed
8	24th Feb 2024	Raised online complaint against FEB month bill amount. Complaint ID – (CMPP12000798580) which was completed on 24th Feb 2024 without providing any solution. I further escalate this to the next level on March 18th, 2024, with new Complaint number CMPP12000806778 which was closed on same day stating the issue is resolved. I called the Toll-free number, and they confirmed in the next bill sundry charges will be removed. However, this didn't happen.	
9	April 24 – July 24	My connection was disconnected without any prior notice in mid of April and remained disconnected till June. I raised this matter and escalated to next level as well.	
10	24th July 24 – 13th August 24	We had taken our grievance to Consumer Grievances Redressal Forum where we submitted written application to restore our electricity and removal of Sundry charges. We submitted in advance of 20,000 /- Rs. to get our electricity restored. After multiple Hearings, Final order was passed stating that there will be no change in the bill as the unbilled amount found is Ok after board took my new meter Average reading of 7554 /313 days from period of 02.05.2024 to 10.03.2024.	Original application copy

### Concerns and Anomalies

There are multiple irregularities I found for which didn't get any satisfactory response nor it was considered while the order was passed and taken any cognizance of it. I would like to mention a few of them as mentioned below. This will give you enough background as this matter is of sheer negligence by the Electricity Dept.

- 1. Old meter reading picture doesn't match with the figure what Board is claiming.
- 2. No valid reason or explanation provided as why Meter Reader or Party own that contract failed to take OK meter reading from period 15.02.2021 17.05.2023 despite my meter was installed outside home on electricity pole.
- 3. When Old meter was removed from Pole, no Acknowledgement was taken from me neither my old meter was shown. Even new meter wasn't installed under my presence.
- 4. My Electricity connection was disconnected without serving prior written notice despite, I submitted online request and then escalated to the next level

as well. For 3 months I had to buy electricity from others and was forced to live a miserable life. Electricity Department *shown no mercy on 70 Years old people*, in a scorching heat month, when temperature was life threatening connection was disconnected which could be fatal to me and my husband. (Refer to S.no point 8 and 9)

- 5. I asked for my old bills copy and submitted written application (application no .1441 on 30/04/2024) but staff said it's not possible for them to share old bills copy in hard or soft format.
- 6. I requested multiple times to Panipat Electricity staff and in front of CGRF to show us our old meter which was never considered seriously.
- 7. In order copy, Copy of Ledger, MCO Copy, Sundry Copy, Meter Pic Manual Reading Sheet were not shared. I asked for it over email and sent multiple reminders, but no response yet received.
- 8. No Action or involvement of Meter reader or Bidder in this case while this whole problem arise today due to their negligence.
- 9. In June 2023 bill (bill no 768025785573) Old meter reading were taken as 24739 However, next 8 months bill from July 2023 till Jan 2024 no mention of 24739 units. For 8 months why, system didn't mark these units as unbilled in next bills and all of sudden in Feb month bill.

It is a humble request. Recently I was hospitalized due to my bad health hence, I am applying for appeal near the stipulated time and it could be possible the application might reach to your office in 2-3 days. Hence, request you to please consider my appeal and not to close this case.

Also, Due to my old age and knee problem I can't travel long distance and wish to get all the hearings to be done via Video conferencing.

- **B.** The appeal was registered on 19.09.2024 as an appeal No. 31/2024 and accordingly, notice of motion to the Appellant and the Respondents was issued for hearing the matter on 29.10.2024.
- **C.** The respondent SDO vide email dated 14.10.2024 has submitted reply, which is reproduced as under:

The consumer made a complaint in CGRF vide complaint No. 226/2024 on dated 24.07.2024 in the name of Smt. Neeru Chopra bearing A/C No. 7680291000 regarding bill correction. As per this office memo no. 1204 dated 30.07.2024 reply submitted to the Secretary, CGRF, Panchkula. The case has been disposed by CGRF UHBVN, Panchkula on dated 13.08.2024.

The detailed of case is as under please: -

The consumer having A/C No. 7680291000 under this S/Divn, as per this office record consumer A/C No. MCO vide EESL No. 320/11978 dated 02.05.2023 in 24739/KWH but AV bill charged to consumer from 15.02.2021 to 17.05.2023. So, as MCO report & reading base consumer Account overhauled and AV bill also adjusted vide SC&AR No. 108/242. Due to blockage reading block reading bill charged to consumer i.e. 4852 to 24739 from 15.02.2021 to 17.05.2023.

It is further intimated that new meter reading base is 24.13/day 7554/313 from 02.05.2023 to 10.03.2024 and old meter reading which amount changed to consumer is 24.67/day from 15.02.2021 to 02.05.2023 (806 days) from 02.05.2023 to 08.08.2024 total consumed units 8621 KWH but in Month of May & June zero units changed to consumer. So base of reading taken him 02.05.2023 to 10.03.2024 i.e. 313 days & 7554 KWH. The copy of reading sheet also enclosed herewith & copy of meter pic. So, as per this office record consumer bill ok and as on meter reading basis.

- D. Hearing was held on 29.10.2024, as scheduled. Both the parties were present during the hearing through video conferencing. At the outset, the appellant briefed the appeal and submitted that the final reading shown is 24739 whereas the pic of the meter shows reading 2473. Further submitted that no meter reading was taken by the meter reader and copy of MCO, ledger etc. has not been provided and sought time to file response on the reply of the respondent. Accordingly, the appellant is directed to file the rejoinder within 10 days with an advance copy to the respondent and the respondent is directed to provide the copy of MCO, details of the amount charged and details of the meter (make of meter, number of digits etc.) with a copy to the appellant. The matter was adjourned for hearing on 21.11.2024.
- **E.** The appellant vide email dated 10.11.2024 has submitted the rejoinder, which is reproduced as under:
  - 1. That the Hon'ble CGRF forum issued an order on 13.08.2024 for complaint no. 226/2024. Order is mentioned below:

After examining the reply of the respondent SDO, the record available on the file and hearing both the parties, the Forum has observed that as per SDO's / Respondent office record, MCO was effected vide EESL No. 320/11978 dated 02.05.2023 on 24739 KWH reading but average bill was charged to the consumer for the period 15.02.2021 to 17.05.223. So as per MCO report and reading base, the account of the consumer was overhauled and average bill adjustment was made vide SC&AR No. 108/242. Due to blockage reading, block reading bill charged to the consumer i.e. 4852 to 24739 KWH from 12.02.2021 to 17.05.2023. further the consumption of the

new meter bases is 24.13 per day i.e. 02.05.2023 to 10.03.2024 and charged amount against consumption of old meter is 24.67 per day from 15.02.2021 to 02.05.2023. so the bill of the consumer is O.K. However, in order to verify the consumption patter, the current reading of the meter was also obtained from SDO/ respondent through Sh. Rakesh Chabra, LM on DC rate who reported the reading of 8621 units on 08.08.2024. The reply of SDO/respondent was found in order. Therefore, the case is disposed of without cost to either of the parties.

I am not satisfied with the decision that has been passed as the order ignored the facts that were pointed out in our application, which was real cause of allowing the reading to be accumulated and turn out to be blockage reading block bill reading bill charged to me from 4852 to 24739.

### 2. Facts – How Chronology of events occurred.

S. No	Event Date/Time	Event Description	Violation of Acts / non- adherence of SOP
1	_	Installation of old M. No.2231203UDN031345	
2	15th Feb 2021 - 17th May 2023	Provisional bills raised by Meter reader continuously from 15.02.2021 – 17.05.2023.	Electricity (Right of Consumers) Rules 2020 Sales Circular no. U-02/2020, point 5.4.6 "the meter is not reading during a billing cycle, the licensee shall prepare a provisional bill in the manner as prescribed under Regulation 6.9 such provisional billing shall not continue for more than two billing cycles at a stretch.
3	17th May 2023	Old meter was removed, and same day new meter was installed.	
4	17th May 2023	No process was being followed by the electricity team who removed or installed the meter. No acknowledgement was taken from us while removing or installing meter neither any meter (new or old) being shown to us.	Sales Circular no. U-02/2020, point 5.2.7 The licensee shall evolve a format of Meter Particulars Sheet for recording the particulars of the meter including initial reading at the time of initial installation or replacement. The licensee shall retain one copy and the second copy, duly signed by the authorized representative of the licensee, shall be given to the consumer under proper acknowledgment. The consumer or his authorized representative shall also sign the Meter Particulars sheet. Subsequently, details including any fault in the meter, repairs and replacements shall be entered into the Meter Particulars Sheet by the licensee.  5.2.8 Whenever a new meter is installed (for a new connection or as a replacement) it shall be sealed in the presence of the consumer. The seal, name plates and distinguishing numbers or marks

			affixed on the said meter or apparatus shall not in any way be broken, erased or altered by the consumer. Sealing arrangements of meter shall be in accordance with the Central Electricity Authority (Installation and Operation of Meters) Regulations, 2006 and all subsequent amendments.
5	June 2023	Bill generated in month of June 2023 where 1359.32 units consumed under my new meter - LT2015390.  However, under Old meter no 2231203UDN03134524739 first time OK reading was taken and 24739 units were recorded. Under Consumed units 111.38 units were only billed. Total units consumed in that month were 1470.7	
6	June 2023 – Jan 2024	From June 2023 – Jan 2024 no mentioned in the bill about the 24739 units.	10×,
7	Feb 2024	105358 /- Rs. Sundry Charges were imposed in the Bill while consumed units was 1367.96. Last photo of old meter reading clearly show 2473 units only however board is claiming there is 9 in the end which make the units from 2473 to 24739	
8	24th Feb 2024	Raised online complaint against FEB month bill amount. Complaint ID – (CMPP12000798580) which was completed on 24th Feb 2024 without providing any solution. I further escalate this to the next level on March 18th, 2024, with new Complaint number CMPP12000806778 which was closed on same day stating the issue is resolved. I called the Toll-free number, and they confirmed in the next bill sundry charges will be removed. However, this didn't happen.	
9	April 24 – July 24	My connection was disconnected without any prior notice in mid of April and remained disconnected till June. I raised this matter and escalated to next level as well.	Sales Circular No. U-39/2013 5.3.1 (i) Any consumer who fails to pay any charged of electricity or any sum other than a charges for electricity due from him, a clear fifteen days notice in writing to such consumer will be given before disconnecting the supply.
10	24th July 24 – 13th August 24	We had taken our grievance to Consumer Grievances Redressal Forum where we submitted written application to restore our electricity and removal of Sundry charges. We submitted in advance of 20,000 /- Rs. to get our electricity restored. After multiple Hearings, Final order was	

	passed stating that there will	
	be no change in the bill as the	
	unbilled amount found is Ok	
	after board took my new meter	
	Average reading of 7554 /313	
	days from period of 02.05.2024	
	to 10.03.2024.	

The fact of the case in brief are:

- 3. Meter reader did not follow Standard of performance and due to his negligence resulted in blockage readings. The meter reader continued creating provisional bills even though he wasn't supposed to raise 3 provisional bills as mentioned in Sr. No. 2 of Point. 2.
  - Sales Circular no. U-02/2020, point 5.4.6 "the meter is not reading during a billing cycle, the licensee shall prepare a provisional bill in the manner as prescribed under Regulation 6.9 such provisional billing shall not continue for more than two billing cycles at a stretch.
- 4. As per below mobile billing management records that being shared by electricity board under passed order by CGRF show meter reading activities from 16.05.2023 till 29.07.2022. However, the disputed period is 12.02.2021 17.05.2023 hence it is still missing the data from 28.07.2022 12.02.2021. Kindly provide the data from this period to ascertain the reasons why meter reader couldn't able to full fill its designated duties for such a long period.
- 5. Under what provision or act Electricity board determines that there is 9 digit at the end of the reading and make complete reading 24739.
- 6. Why board failed to continuously display the blockage reading of 24739 in the next consecutive bill from July, 2023 till Jan 2024. Kindly explain.
- 7. What action was taken by board when I submitted complaint in call center against the Feb 2024 bill. Bill no. 768029142729 showing 105358 rs under sundry expenses. I submitted first complaint CMPP12000798580 which was closed on 24.02.2024 without providing solution and when escalated to next level under complaint no. CMPP12000806778 it was surprisingly closed on same day without providing any solution or contacting me first to listen my grievance. Despite it should be treated with diligence and priority board show no interest at all. Once again, here board fail to meets its standard of performance and breached consumer rights. Board needs to clarity what action they took under both complaints and why they didn't reach to me despite it was escalated. Refer to Sr. no. 8 of point 2.
- 8. Since my voice was unheard by the board as per point 7, they miss use their powers and disconnected my electricity connection in April 2024 to July 2024 until the matter was taken to CGRF. Here board did violation of Sales Circular no. U-39/2023 5.3.1 (i) and didn't serve any written notice to me.

- (i) Any consumer who fails to pay any charged of electricity or any sum other than a charges for electricity due from him, a clear fifteen days notice in writing to such consumer will be given before disconnecting the supply.
- 9. No process was followed by the electricity team who removed or installed the new meter. No acknowledgment was taken from us while removing and installing new meter neither any meter (new or old) being shown to us.

  Sales circular no. U-02/2020
  - 5.2.7 The licensee shall evolve a format of Meter Particulars Sheet for recording the particulars of the meter including initial reading at the time of initial installation or replacement. The licensee shall retain one copy and the second copy, duly signed by the authorized representative of the licensee, shall be given to the consumer under proper acknowledgment. The consumer or his authorized representative shall also sign the Meter Particulars sheet. Subsequently, details including any fault in the meter, repairs and replacements shall be entered into the Meter Particulars Sheet by the licensee.
  - 5.2.8 Whenever a new meter is installed (for a new connection or as a replacement) it shall be sealed in the presence of the consumer. The seal, name plates and distinguishing numbers or marks affixed on the said meter or apparatus shall not in any way be broken, erased or altered by the consumer. Sealing arrangements of meter shall be in accordance with the Central Electricity Authority (Installation and Operation of Meters) Regulations, 2006 and all subsequent amendments.
- F. Hearing was held on 21.11.2024, as scheduled. Both the parties were present through video conferencing. At the outset, the respondent CA submitted that in compliance of interim order dated 29.10.2024, photo of old and new meter, copy of Sundry, copy of MCO, copy of ledger and reading sheet has been submitted to the EO office as well as consumer vide email dated 06.11.2024 and dated 18.11.2024. The MCO was issued for installing smart meter and effected by EESL on 02.05.2023. The old meter was removed at final reading of 24739 with working status of the meter OK. Since average bills were issued to the appellant during the period from 15.02.2021 to 17.05.2023, the bill was revised on actual consumption recorded in his old meter after spreading the consumption over a period from 15.02.2021 to 02.05.2023, to give slab benefit to the consumer and after deducting already billed units. Further submitted that the old meter was L&T make having five digit and one decimal digit and the amount charged is rightly payable by the

appellant. Per contra, the appellant submitted that last digit '9' of the reading was not clearly visible in the photo of the meter.

- **G.** After hearing both parties, the respondent was directed to file an affidavit about make of old meter, no of digits in the meter, final reading in the meter at time of its removal from the site to decide the matter. The Appellant agreed to decide the matter after receiving the said affidavit of the respondent.
  - In compliance to the directions issued to the respondent to file an affidavit, the respondent CA has submitted affidavit dated 22.11.2024 confirming that Account No. 7680291000 is in the name of Smt. Neeru Chopra. The smart meter has been replaced on 02.05.2023. the old meter was of L&T company having 5 digits plus one decimal. The final reading recorded was 24739.
- **H.** In view of the above facts and discussions, since the account has been overhauled on the basis of actual consumption recorded in the meter for the period from 15.02.2021 to 02.05.2023 in which the appellant was billed on average basis, the legitimate bill so raised is payable by the appellant. Therefore, the order dated 13.08.2024 of CGRF UHBVN is upheld.

The instant appeal is disposed of accordingly.

Both the parties to bear their own costs. File may be consigned to record.

Given under my hand on 25th November, 2024.

Sd/-

(Virendra Singh)
Electricity Ombudsman, Haryana

CC-

Dated: 25.11.2024

# Memo. No.4064-70/HERC/EO/Appeal No. 31/2024 Dated: 25.11.2024

- 1. Smt. Neeru Chopra W/o Shri Vinod Chopra, House No. 35-36, Shanti Nagar, Model Town, Panipat.
- 2. The Managing Director, UHBVN, IP No.: 3&4, Sector-14, Panchkula.
- 3. Legal Remembrancer, Haryana Power Utilities, Sec- 6, Panchkula
- 4. The Chief Engineer (Operation), UHBVN, Old Power House Colony, Circular Road, Rohtak
- 5. The SE (Operation), UHBVN, 132 KV Sub Station, Gohana, Road, Panipat.
- 6. The XEN (Operation), City Division, UHBVN, 132 KV Sub Station, Gohana, Road, Panipat.
- 7. The SDO (Operation), Model Town Sub-Division, UHBVN, 132 KV Sub Station, Gohana, Road, Panipat.